

# INTERNATIONAL PEDIATRIC ASSOCIATION VACCINE HESITANCY PROJECT

# 1<sup>st</sup> INTERNATIONAL TRAINING OF TRAINERS WORKSHOP

### 14-16 DECEMBER 2018

### NEW DELHI, INDIA

### &

### 2nd INTERNATIONAL TRAINING OF TRAINERS WORKSHOP

# 16-17 MARCH 2019

# PANAMA

With Support From:





Under Academic Grant From:

SANOFI PASTEUR 🎝

SERUM INSTITUTE OF INDIA

o G

Global Health Strategies

# **TABLE OF CONTENT**

Sr. no	Contents	Page no.
1	Background	3
2	IPA Vaccine Hesitancy Project	3
3	International Training of Trainers Workshop	5
4	Feedback from Participants	6
5	Annexure I-List of Participants (Delhi ToT)	13
6	Annexure II-List of Participants (Panama ToT)	16
7	Photographs	18

#### Background

In 2011, the World Health Organization Strategic Advisory Group of Experts on Immunization (SAGE) noted the growing recognition of the negative impacts of vaccine hesitancy on uptake rates and program efficiency. Based on the concerns about hesitancy and its impact on vaccine uptake rates and the performance of national immunization programs, WHO SAGE established the Working Group on Vaccine Hesitancy in March 2012 to carry out a thorough review and propose recommendations on how to address vaccine hesitancy and its determinants.

According to final report submitted by the SAGE working group in October 2014:

"Vaccine hesitancy refers to delay in acceptance or refusal of vaccines despite availability of vaccination services. Vaccine hesitancy is complex and context specific, varying across time, place and vaccines. It is influenced by factors such as complacency, convenience and confidence"

#### **IPA Vaccine Hesitancy Project:**

The International Pediatric Association (IPA) is a 110 years old umbrella organization of one million pediatricians of the world taking care of more than one billion children. IPA represents pediatricians from over 140 countries and 150 member societies enabling them to work together to improve the physical, mental and social health and wellbeing of all children, from birth through adolescence.

IPA has conducted Immunization Champion workshops in Johannesburg (2010), Melbourne (2013) and Vancouver (2016 with AAP) to train a pool of Immunization Champions. IPA regional societies, including the Asia Pacific Pediatric Association (APPA) and Union of National African Pediatric Societies and Associations (UNAPSA) among others, have also trained their pediatric leaders in immunization advocacy.

IPA through its Technical Advisory Group on Immunization (TAGI) has also worked proactively as an important partner of the Measles and Rubella (MR) Initiative since 2010.

IPA is a well-placed advocate to voice key messages for vaccine promotion. IPA propose to play a crucial role in addressing vaccine hesitancy by bringing together a coalition of organizations who are key stakeholders to deal with this pressing issue. The issue continues to spread like wild fire across the world and threatens to nullify the significant gains of immunization so far. Given the ability to reach out to local communities through regional and national pediatric societies, IPA's membership is poised to recognize localized issues and bring them to the attention of national leadership.

Although reports of public concerns and questions around the safety and relevance of vaccines have been on the rise, aside from monitoring of adverse events following immunization (AEFI), there is neither systematic monitoring of broader public vaccine concerns nor a tool to assess risk levels of rumors and concerns to potential program disruptions, vaccine refusals and potential disease outbreaks.

Studies undertaken by several individuals and organizations have recognized the important role of medical professionals but until now no one has tried to involve them systematically. IPA took the initiative and mobilize its huge network to unite and take action on the important issue of vaccine hesitancy.

#### International Training of Trainers Workshops

International Pediatric Association organized 1<sup>st</sup> International Training of Trainers workshop, 14-16 December 2018 at Hotel Vivanta Dwarka (By Taj), New Delhi and 2<sup>nd</sup> International training of trainers' workshop on 16-17 March 2019 at Atlapa Convention Center, Panama. The ultimate goal of IPA Vaccine Hesitancy Project is to reduce vaccine hesitancy in communities, disseminate the value of vaccination, increase demand for immunization, and to help reach the targets of the Global Vaccine Action Plan, and the sustainable developments goals.

Through these workshops, IPA aimed to establish a pool of master trainer pediatricians in each selected country who will conduct a series of workshops for pediatricians in their country. The event attracted 83 participants, chairs and faculty from 21 countries in Delhi and 62 participants, chairs and faculty from 20 countries in Panama.

Deliverables of Workshop:

- Increased effectiveness of the conversation between HCPs and patients on healthy preventive behaviors utilizing behavior- centered approaches, building trust and create a positive decision to vaccinate.
- 2. Empowered national pediatric societies and pediatricians to use broader VoV messaging to communicate the need for immunization more effectively.
- 3. Sensitized pediatrician in basic principles of advocacy and how to do advocacy for immunization
- 4. Media training for master trainers who will in turn train pediatricians in their respective countries.

The workshop comprised of lectures, interactive sessions, and group work and so on. The comprehensive workshop provided training on Global Immunization Update, Vaccine Safety and Surveillance, Current issues in Immunization, Addressing Vaccine Hesitancy, Basics of Advocacy etc. as a whole the workshop aimed to improve Interpersonal relationship between health care providers and care givers.

#### Feedback from Participants

Before the workshop, pre- session questionnaire was shared with participants for Evaluation. Below are the findings of the pre-session questionnaire.

Sr. No	Question	Ν	Categories	Count	Frequency (%)
	Thoughts on Vaccination				
3	I general trust vaccination	69	10 (Strongly a gree)	65	92.9%
			9	4	5.7%
4	Vaccination forms part of a healthy lifestyle	70	10 (Strongly a gree)	68	97.1%
			9	1	1.4%
			8	1	1.4%
5	I feel that it is important that I get vaccinated	71	10 (Strongly a gree)	67	95.7%
			9	3	4.3%
6	I understand how vaccination helps my body fight infectious disease	68	10 (Strongly agree)	64	91.4%
			9	3	4.3%
			7(strongly Agree)	1	1.4%
7	I generally trust vaccine manufacturers or pharmaceutical companies	70	10 (Strongly a gree)	29	41.4%
			9	17	24.3%
			8	12	17.1%
			7(strongly Agree)	5	7.1%
			6	4	5.7%
			5 (Neutral)	3	4.3%
8	I generally trust the National Health Authorities	70	10 (Strongly a gree)	37	52.9%
			9	11	15.7%
			8	14	20.0%
			7(strongly Agree)	3	4.3%
			6	2	2.9%
			5 (Neutral)	2	2.9%
			4	1	1.4%
9	When I talk with my patients, their beliefs about vaccination become more positive.	67	7(strongly Agree)	45	64.3%
			6	15	21.4%
		1	5 (Neutral)	6	8.6%

			4	1	1.4%
10	Discussing vaccination with my patients is very important to me.	66	7(strongly Agree)	58	82.9%
			6	5	7.1%
			5 (Neutral)	3	4.3%
11	My conversations with my patients can really make their opinions about vaccination become more positive.	67	7(strongly Agree)	43	61.4%
			6	17	24.3%
			5 (Neutral)	5	7.1%
			4	2	2.9%
12	I am committed to having conversations on vaccination with my patients.	67	7(strongly Agree)	56	80.0%
			6	7	10.0%
			5 (Neutral)	3	4.3%
			4	1	1.4%
13	It is crucial that I mention the topic of vaccination to my patients.	67	7(strongly Agree)	58	82.9%
			6	4	5.7%
			5 (Neutral)	4	5.7%
			3	1	1.4%
14	It is essential that I talk about vaccination with my patients.	67	7(strongly Agree)	56	80.0%
			6	6	8.6%
			5 (Neutral)	4	5.7%
			3	1	1.4%
15	My patients' views of vaccination become much more favourable after I discuss this topic with them.	67	7(strongly Agree)	35	52.2%
			6	23	34.3%
			5 (Neutral)	6	8.9%
			4	2	2.9%
			1 (Strongly disagree)	1	1.70%
16	I am confident I can answer questions that my patients could ask me about vaccination.	67	7(strongly Agree)	56	80.0%
			6	10	14.3%
			4	1	1.4%
17	I feel a moral obligation to discuss vaccination with my patients.	67	7(strongly Agree)	56	80.0%
	1		6	8	11.4%

			5 (Neutral)	3	4.3%
18	It is my duty to talk about vaccination with my patients.	67	7(strongly Agree)	58	82.9%
			6	7	10.0%
			5 (Neutral)	1	1.4%
			4	1	1.4%
19	I feel competent to discuss vaccination	67	7(strongly Agree)	52	74.3%
			6	11	15.7%
			5 (Neutral)	2	2.9%
			4	2	2.9%
20	I know exactly what to say about vaccination when I talk to my patients.	67	7(strongly Agree)	38	54.3%
			6	22	31.4%
			5 (Neutral)	4	5.7%
			4	3	4.3%
21	Is vaccination hesitancy a challenge in your practice?	66	YES	47	67.1%
	If yes, please describe briefly the context?		NO	19	27.1%

#### Post- session Evaluation:

After the workshop, a program evaluation was done to get feedback of participants after attending the workshop. Below are the responses to the program evaluation.

#### **Responses of Program Evaluation:**

Sr No.	Question	Ν	Category	Count	Percentage
1	Attended similar workshop in the past?	81	No	58	71.6%
			Yes	23	28.4%
3	I will keep the training in good memory	81	10 (Strongly agree)	41	50.6%
			9	15	18.5%
			8	17	21.0%
			7	7	8.6%
			6	1	1.2%
4	Participation in this kind of training is very useful for my job	81	10 (Strongly agree)	41	50.6%
			9	18	22.2%
			8	13	16.0%

			7	5	6.2%
			6	3	3.7%
			5 (Neutral)	1	1.2%
5	After the training, I know substantially more about the training contents than before	81	10 (Strongly agree)	32	39.5%
			9	20	24.7%
			8	10	12.3%
			7	16	19.8%
			6	2	2.5%
			5 (Neutral)	1	1.2%
6	I enjoyed the training very much	80	10 (Strongly agree)	38	46.9%
			9	19	23.5%
			8	10	12.3%
			7	10	12.3%
			6	3	3.7%
7	The training is very beneficial to my work	81	10 (Strongly agree)	36	44.4%
			9	18	22.2%
			8	18	22.2%
			7	6	7.4%
			6	3	3.7%
8	I learned a lot of new things in the training	81	10 (Strongly agree)	25	30.9%
			9	18	22.2%
			8	18	22.2%
			7	13	16.0%
			6	6	7.4%
			5 (Neutral)	1	1.2%
9	When I talk with my patients, their beliefs about vaccination become more positive.	81	Very Good	52	64.2%
			Good	28	34.6%
			Poor	1	1.2%
10	Discussing vaccination with my patients is very important to me.	81	Very Good	65	80.2%
			Good	16	19.8%
	My conversations with my		Very Good	59	72.8%
11	patients can really make their opinions about vaccination become more positive.	80	Good	21	25.9%

12	I am commited to having conversations on vaccination with my patients.	81	Very Good	63	77.8%
			Good	18	22.2%
13	It is crucial that I mention the topic of vaccination to my patients.	81	Very Good	63	77.8%
			Good	18	22.2%
14	It is essential that I talk about vaccination with my patients.	81	Very Good	69	85.2%
			Good	12	14.8%
15	Technical Content: How would you rate this course on following criteria:				
А	Transfer of useful knowledge	81	Adequate	61	75.3%
	about how vaccine advocacy		Fairly Adequate	3	3.7%
	affects individual host		Too much	17	21.0%
В	Transfer of useful knowledge	81	Adequate	55	67.9%
	about how vaccine advocacy		Fairly Adequate	6	7.4%
	perform in the community		Too much	20	24.7%
С	Transfer of skills to explore	81	Adequate	54	66.7%
	policies, sociological and		Fairly Adequate	8	9.9%
	programmatic barriers in the way		Too much	19	23.5%
	to achieving immunization goal				
D	Instillation of confidence arising	80	Adequate	52	64.2%
	out of improved knowledge and		Fairly Adequate	4	4.9%
	motivation to enable you to be a		Not Adequate	1	1.2%
	change agent for vaccine advocacy		Too much	23	28.4%
23	Did you like the pre-course learning material?	76	A lot	24	29.6%
			lt was ok	31	38.3%
			Very much	21	25.9%
24	What is your assessment of pre-course communications and learning material?				
А	Study material quality,	75	Excellent	18	22.2%
	comprehensiveness		Very Good	39	48.1%
			Good	18	22.2%

В	Timeliness of communication	74	Excellent	25	30.9%
			Very Good	32	39.5%
			Good	17	21.0%
С	Guidance and assistance	73	Excellent	26	32.1%
			Very Good	31	38.3%
			Good	16	19.8%
25	Time management during the course	81	Excellent	31	38.3%
			Very Good	35	43.2%
			Good	14	17.3%
			Fair	1	1.2%

Looking at the date from an overall perspective, we can see that the participants benefitted from attending the course and have a better understanding of the concept of vaccine hesitancy and measures to deal with it during their daily interactions with patients. More than 70% participants believe that the skills obtained from the course will be helpful in improving vaccine uptake in their practice. It is likely that the rest may be already adept at the issue since about 28% had attended similar workshops in the past."

List of Participants:

- 1. Anna Ong Lim, Philippines
- 2. Antonio Conejo, Spain
- 3. Arifianto Riyanto Marosin, Indonesia
- 4. Ashish Pathak, India
- 5. Augustine Omiogberale, Nigeria
- 6. Bakul Jayant Parekh, India
- 7. Caglar Cuhadaroglu, Turkey
- 8. Christine Karanje Chege, Kenya
- 9. Elena Bozzola, Italy
- 10. Fatima Gimenez, Philippines
- 11. Gacem Ourida, Algeria
- 12. Giulia Spina, Italy
- 13. Harish Pemde, India
- 14. Hartono Gunardi, Indonesia
- 15. Irina Fridman, Russia
- 16. Jagdish Chinnappa, India
- 17. James Gathuki Njeru, Kenya
- 18. Jaydeep Choudhury, India
- 19. Maduka Ughasoro, Nigeria
- 20. Marina Fedoseenko, Russia
- 21. Maria Salvacion Gatchalian,
- 22. Mcmillan Douglas, Canada
- 23. Mehmet Ceyhan, Turkey
- 24. Noorhaire Sumarlie Bin Nordin, Indonesia
- 25. Pallab Chattopadhayay, India
- 26. Rachida Boukari, Algeria
- 27. Rohit Agarwal, India
- 28. Smail Mesbah, Algeria
- 29. Soedjatmiko Soejitno, Indonesia
- 30. Upendra S Kingwadekar, India
- 31. Vipin M Vashishtha, India
- 32. Basim Al Zoubi, Jordan
- 33. Dorothy Esangbedo, Nigeria
- 34. Enver Hasanoglu, Turkey
- 35. Fugen Cullu Cokugras, Turkey
- 36. Leyla Namazova Baranova, Russia
- 37. Mariana Lopez, Panama
- 38. Pramod Jog, India

- 39. Shanti Raman, Australia
- 40. Stefano Del Torso, Italy
- 41. Zulkifli Ismail, Malaysia

#### List of Observers:

- 1. Daniel Erchick, GHS, India
- 2. Janna Patterson, AAP, USA
- 3. Kalpana Sharma, GHS, India
- 4. Hemant Khanna, Sanofi Pasteur, India
- 5. Manoj Grover, Sanofi Pasteur, India
- 6. Chime Denis Nnadi, Merck, USA
- 7. Lilian Ong, Sanofi Pasteur, Malaysia
- 8. Marion Delattre, Sanofi Pasteur, France
- 9. Niti Behal, India
- 10. Maria Liela Penalosa, Sanofi Pasteur, Philippines
- 11. Saransh Mahajan, GHS, India
- 12. Sophia Lonappan, GHS, India
- 13. Mahtab Irani, GHS, India
- 14. Priyansh Banerjee, GHS, India
- 15. Sharanya Naiper-Raman, Australia
- 16. Monisha Choudhury, CHF, India
- 17. Molly Sauer, IVAC, USA

#### **ANNEXURE II – Panama ToT**

#### List of participants:

- 1. Alberto Bissot, Panama
- 2. Amah Madeleine Amorissani Folquet, Ivory Coast
- 3. Aman Pulungan, Indonesia
- 4. Ashok Gupta, India
- 5. Edgar Allan Vargas, Dominican Republic
- 6. Gohar Rehman, Pakistan
- 7. Julia Fernandez Monge, Costa Rica
- 8. Marcela Fama, Colombia
- 9. Mario Castillo, Honduras
- 10. Todd Wolynn, USA
- 11. Veronica Alicia Gomez Hernandez, Gautemala
- 12. Amanda Dempsey, USA
- 13. Adriana Chung, Panama
- 14. Alejandro Macias, Mexico
- 15. Amilcar Ulises Valencia Garin, Mexico
- 16. Barbara Pahud
- 17. Carla Vizzotti
- 18. Carmen Espinosa
- 19. Dora Estripeaut, Panama
- 20. Fedreico Martinon, Spain
- 21. Greta Munoz, Ecuador
- 22. Guillermo Barahona, El Salvador
- 23. Gustavo Lazo, Costa Rica
- 24. Herberth Briones, Gautemala
- 25. Jose Almario, Panama
- 26. Luiza Fallerios, Brazil
- 27. Marcella Mendez, Costa Rica
- 28. Maria Rios, Panama
- 29. Mauricio Guerrero, Colombia
- 30. Melissa Palmieri, Brazil
- 31. Miriam de Lourdes Duenas, El Salvador
- 32. Mitzila Rosas, Panama
- 33. Muhammad Ashraf Sultan, Pakistan
- 34. Norberto Giglio, Argentina
- 35. Norma Matias, Mexico
- 36. Renato Kfouri, Colombia
- 37. Silvia Gonzalez Ayala, Argentina
- 38. Somashekhar Nimbalkar, India

- 39. Tania Petraglia, Brazil
- 40. Ximena Norero, Panama
- 41. Jose Brea Del Castillo, Dominican Republica
- 42. Miguel O'Ryan, Chile

#### List of Observers:

- 1. Alireza Mafi, Turkey
- 2. Carla Simonetto, Argentina
- 3. Gerald Moncayo, Panama
- 4. Maria Victoria Bourges, Panama
- 5. Marion Delattre, France
- 6. Ofelina Vergara
- 7. Ricardo Acosta

### Photographs



**Opening Ceremony – Delhi ToT** 



### **Breakout Session – Delhi ToT**



Session by Dr Angus Thomson – Delhi ToT



Group Photo – Delhi ToT



Session by Dr Saad Omer - Panama ToT



LATAM Participants - Panama ToT



Breakout Session - Panama ToT



Group Photo - Panama ToT